

## INDONESIAN STUDENTS' PERSPECTIVES ON ELT IN SHADOW EDUCATION

Qurrotul Aini S<sup>1</sup> and Kristian Adi Putra<sup>2</sup>

Universitas Sebelas Maret<sup>1,2</sup>

[qurrotulainis@student.uns.ac.id](mailto:qurrotulainis@student.uns.ac.id), [kristianadiputra@staff.uns.ac.id](mailto:kristianadiputra@staff.uns.ac.id)

### Abstract

The demand for shadow education in Indonesia is continuously increasing, raising doubts about the quality of teaching at schools. Therefore, this study aims to analyze students' perceptions of English language teaching in shadow education compared to those at schools. This study uses semi-structured individual interviews to obtain rich data on students' experiences and perceptions. The participants were secondary-level students who were well-experienced in the English shadow education program. This study showed that students' perception of shadow teaching covered several aspects, such as teaching materials, learning outcomes, teaching activities, teachers' teaching performance, and learning media. Practically, the student's perspective towards shadow education had an average of positive experiences. Furthermore, the implications of the present study call for a sense of urgency among policymakers and education authorities to consider curricular and methodological overhauling to enhance English teaching efficiency and students' learning outcomes in line with students' needs, preferences, and concerns in shadow teaching.

**Keywords:** *ELT in Indonesia, Shadow Education*

### Introduction

Shadow education, or private tutoring in other studies, is a global business that has drawn significant attention from academics and decision-makers. It is a common phenomenon that private supplementary tutoring is considered shadow education (Bray & Silova, 2006). Furthermore, shadow education is a service of additional private tutoring that exists simultaneously with mainstream schooling and 'shadow' the regular school system (Bray, 2014). Many students all over the world take advantage of private tutoring. Over 50% of secondary school pupils in numerous Asian nations, including Bangladesh, China, Japan, Singapore, South Korea, and Thailand, receive some private tutoring (see Bray & Lykins, 2012). Significantly, in Indonesia, what distinguishes between shadow education and private tutoring is in terms of their management; shadow education is hosted by private institutions that have a clear organizational structure.

In contrast, private tutoring is owned by independent individuals. Bray (2009) and Yung and Bray (2017) refer to shadow education as private tutoring or the paid services students use to enhance their in-person education outside regular school hours. Lecture-style tutoring in so-called cram schools run by huge tutoring companies is prevalent in many Asian environments (Chung, 2013; de Castro & de Guzman, 2014; Yung, 2019). As well as in Indonesia, the number of shadow education increases yearly. Statistically, in Central Java, Indonesia, mainly in 2009, there were 113 shadow education licenses by the Directorate of Courses and Training of the Ministry of Education and Culture (MoEC). In 2017 it increased to 162 shadow education; its growth over nine years is very significant and reaches 70 percent. Shadow education grows and develops in big cities and district capitals.

Although research on shadow education has gained visibility in recent years, its subcategory, Private tutoring in English (PT-E), is yet to receive considerable attention (Coniam, 2013; Hamid, Sussex, & Khan, 2009; Yung, 2014). In the age of globalization and the growth of English worldwide, where mastery of the international language is associated with personal mobility and social advancement, research on ELT in shadow education is essential. (e.g.,

Erling & Seargeant, 2013). Furthermore, the policy's acknowledgment of this significance for English is supported by the increased and earlier inclusion of English in the curriculum across the globe (e.g., Baldauf, Kaplan, Kamwangamalu, & Bryant, 2012; Hamid, 2010). In order to address this, the article examines student perceptions of ELT in shadow education in Indonesia, a developed country of 270 million people in Southeast Asia, where English is taught as a second language. These inquiries raise issues with education in general and English language instruction, a crucial aspect of the national curriculum.

Therefore, students' perceptions need to be analyzed critically to understand how and why students perceive the effectiveness of ELT in shadow education. It specifically challenges secondary school students' conceptions of how tutors assist them in learning English in a system where private tutoring predominates. This is a crucial area for analysis because beliefs shape behavior, and participation in tutorial sessions, which frequently follow mainstream ELT classes, significantly impact students' learning. However, students assess tutors according to their standards, and the larger educational environment in which they are located may shape their opinions. Furthermore, the implications in the article call for a sense of urgency among policymakers and school authorities to consider curricular and methodological overhauling to enhance English teaching efficiency and students' learning outcomes in line with students' needs, preferences, and concerns. In the present study, I explore students' perceptions of ELT in shadow education with the following research questions:

- (1) What was taught in English lessons in shadow education?
- (2) How did students' perspectives on ELT in shadow education?

The Indonesian national curriculum has seen several revisions over the years. Naturally, it causes some changes in education, learning, and assessment (Retnawati, Hadi, & Nugraha, 2016). Hence, before adopting the new curriculum, teachers—the primary agents in educating students—must thoroughly understand it and simultaneously develop their skills (Muth'im, 2014) to evoke students in a pleasant and meaningful learning environment. In addition to various standards on the curriculum syllabus, teachers must understand the curriculum's content, the planning stage activities, and the evaluation based on the curriculum focus (Handler, 2010). Teachers should also receive training in teaching techniques and education about English language curricular policy and its significance (Rafique, Sultan, Ahmad, & Imran, 2018). It is necessary since the teachers' readiness and optimal implementation determine the success of new curriculum implementation (Rumahlatu, Huliselan, & Takaria, 2016). To improve the education system in Indonesia, the latest curriculum applied is the 2013 curriculum (K-13) which has been implemented since July 2013. The K-13 curriculum empowers Indonesians to become religious, productive, innovative, and passionate citizens. It emphasizes learning designed by teachers (the taught curriculum) and learning experience (the experienced curriculum) based on students' socio-cultural backgrounds and abilities (Widodo, 2016). It is designed to meet the century's needs (Tantra, 2013). Even though Indonesian curricula have undergone numerous changes, the English language remains a mandatory subject (Hawanti, 2014). In English Language Teaching (ELT), the transformation of the national curriculum in Indonesia offers a new challenge for English teachers. They must consider the excellent lesson plan, creative and meaningful teaching and learning process, and learning outcomes assessment. It is crucial to construct a lesson plan since it covers all of the objectives, learning activities, and assessment processes (Ediger, 2002). In ELT K-13, the lesson planning needs to reflect core and basic competencies. The three essential competencies of affective, cognitive, and psycho-motor are grouped into the core competencies, which cover spiritual attitudes, social attitudes, knowledge, and skills. The current curriculum also mandates that teachers adopt a scientifically based learning cycle while engaging students in the teaching and learning process. The cycle comprises observing, questioning, exploring/experimenting, associating, and communicating. Last, the ELT K-13 prioritized cognitively challenging

evaluation, where students' competence is determined by formal assessment while emphasizing process and product-based assessment (Widodo, 2016).

English is regarded as a foreign language in Indonesia (EFL). English is the first foreign language in Indonesia, and for a long time, it has been studied only in secondary schools. However, in the 1994 revised curriculum, English is included as a subject in the primary school curriculum, starting in the third grade of elementary school. However, only private and government elementary schools in urban regions would have English teachers on staff. Due to a lack of qualified teachers, primary schools in rural areas continue to refrain from offering English as a subject in their timetables. The weekly teaching time for English is around two hours. The reorientation of ELT aims over the past few years has been particularly significant in Indonesia. As Huda (1993:113-114) proposed, in 1967, a ministerial decree stipulated that English instruction in secondary schools was intended to equip students with a "working knowledge of English" to make them possible to read English-language books and reference materials, introduce Indonesian culture to international populations, comprehend lectures given by foreign lecturers, communicate with people from other countries, participate in oral examinations with foreign lecturers and discussions with students. The development of speaking and listening skills at the primary level and speaking and reading in secondary schools seem more focused than before in the 1994 English curriculum. As Dardjowidjojo (1996) observed, "Indonesia had to pay rather dearly for the success of having a national language since the success turns out to have been achieved at the expense of having a deficient ability in English ."Although this "low ability" has been attributed to a "flip-flopping" in English language teaching methodology (from grammar-centered methodology to communicative teaching), Dardjowidjojo (1996) blame a shortage of student enthusiasm, students' negative attitudes toward learning English, and a lack of teachers who are sufficiently fluent in the language.

Additionally, Sadtono (1976) proposed that the lack of motivation to learn English would be the leading cause. However, he also reasoned that "sociologically speaking, the Indonesian people at the moment do not perceive any immediate use or benefit from learning English. "As a survey (see Huda 1993) shows, this perception is changing. Due to regionalization and globalization, English is now considered a business language that should be mastered for personal and professional benefits.

In the 'non-native' English-speaking world, where English is seen as a crucial linguistic capital (Bourdieu, 1977; Hamid, 2016), the outside of the classroom learning environment, where ELT in shadow education is viewed as a crucial means to academic performance and English language achievements, has just recently drawn researchers' notice. Three categories can be used to classify the few studies considering ELT in shadow education. First, some studies acknowledge the role of ELT in shadow education, although these do not directly investigate ELT in shadow education participation or academic outcomes (e.g., Bray & Kwok, 2003; Hamid & Baldauf, 2011; Lee, 2010; Park, 2009; Park & Abelman, 2004). In the second set of studies, ELT in shadow education is primarily taken into account test results for English as a second language along with results from other topics that are considered indicators of academic achievement (e.g., Lee, Kim, & Yoon, 2004; Park, Byun, & Kim, 2011; see also Bray, 2013; Bray & Lykins, 2012). According to our literature search, Only a few studies fit into the third group of studies, with the best attention paid to ELT in shadow education.

Alotaibi (2014) interviewed a separate sample of Saudi secondary school students and their parents to learn more about their perspectives on the reasons behind private English tutoring. He notes that the reasons for private English tutoring are determined to be the difficulty of the English language, poor teacher performance, social pressure, variability in student comprehension levels at School, a weak English foundation from earlier school years, frequent student absences from class, large classes, and English-heavy teaching loads. Then, findings in William's research (2018) revealed that According to their academic success or

issues, parental decision, and opinion on the value of private tutoring services, kids sign up for private tutoring services. Additionally, he recommended that institutions of higher learning and decision-makers conduct in-depth research on these issues and develop solid regulations to enhance students' ordinary schooling experiences. To get a fair assessment of the causal impact of ELT in shadow education on students' English proficiency, it is necessary to take into account the social and personal aspects that affect students' willingness to participate in ELT in shadow education. Few studies of ELT in shadow education in Indonesia provided further motivation for examining student perceptions of ELT in the Indonesian context, particularly in secondary school students.

## **Method**

This study was conducted in one of the prominent shadow education centers in Central Java. The study participants comprised four students enrolled in the ELT in shadow education. The participants are secondary-level students who are well-experienced in shadow education. They are aged 15-17. This study uses semi-structured, individual interviews to obtain rich data on students' experiences and perceptions, which enriches the exploration of additional unexpected questions from students when exciting subjects and opinions are discussed. I will become close to the participants by utilizing qualitative interviews and reflecting on my assumptions, experiences, and emotional engagement throughout the fieldwork. Accordingly, interviews are the most appropriate method of collecting rich data about students' experiences and thinking. Purposive sampling will be used in this small-scale research. Purposive sampling was used to identify and establish contacts with students who met the specific criteria of the study. These criteria include the following: the student must conduct ELT in shadow education and attend secondary school students at least in the 4th semester.

The data collection occurred in December 2022 during a month in one of the shadow education in Central Java, Indonesia. All interviews were conducted face to face and audio recorded. It was conducted using Bahasa Indonesia and later transcribed into the English language. The interview session took time 30 to 60 minutes for each student. The foci of the interview questions were on the following aspects of the participant students' personal experiences during their learning activity: 1) teaching and learning activities (Wei & Guan, 2021), 2) the teaching and learning outcome (Loyalka & Zakharov 2016; Yung & Bray, 2007), 3) teaching and learning media, 4) teacher's teaching performance (Bray, et, al. 2018) 5) language used, and (6) learning challenges. The data sets used for the analysis also include reflective notes and memos. Data analysis is used as thematic analysis. Thematic analysis is a method for analyzing qualitative data that entails searching across a data set to identify, analyze, and report repeated patterns (Braun & Clarke, 2006).

Furthermore, the trustworthiness used is the triangulation of sources. According to Creswell (2007), there are some types of triangulation; sources, methods, investigators, and theories to corroborate evidence. In this study, I used sources triangulation to get data validity. Sources triangulation is meant to compare the data finding with interview to the participants of the study and providing an opportunity for them to comment on the finding. This technique is meant to determine the accuracy of the qualitative findings.

## **Findings and Discussions**

This section presented the results of data from interviews that have been conducted. Two sections focus on answering the research questions. First, an explanation of the teaching program, learning materials, techniques in learning, and assessment in shadow education in general, and then continued with an explanation of students' attitudes or perceptions of English language learning at the shadow education. Their attitudes toward ELT in shadow education covered the teaching and learning activities, teaching and learning outcome, teaching and

learning media, teaching performance by the teacher, the language used, and their challenge while studying English in shadow education.

### ***ELT Materials Covered in Shadow Education***

This section only focused on the program, materials, teaching techniques, and assessment used in shadow education. We limited our research area due to the accessibility of the information we were looking for only limited to these areas. Starting with the shadow education program, all the programs provided are similar to the national and school curricula. For example, in terms of class division for learning, the class was divided based on the grade of students in their schools. Thus, in shadow education, the class started from elementary to secondary level. At the secondary level, the class was also divided due to the program or significance taken by students at school. They were natural science and social science class.

As well as, the materials conducted in shadow education, particularly in English language teaching classes, were similar to the national curriculum and school curriculum. Learning materials taught by teachers follow the wants and needs of students. If students need a discussion in answering questions about their school assignments, then the learning material at that time will focus on discussing the questions only. It aligns with shadow education's fundamental purpose: to teach students for tests. Zooming out to the subject of the material, in shadow education, the teacher usually taught about grammar and how to answer grammar tests. So, English is optional as a communication tool, but learning English based on theory is very important. However, if, at that time, students did not need to discuss questions related to their assignments from the School, the teacher provided learning materials based on the competencies compiled by institutions that follow the latest curriculum. Most teachers would teach their students material or subjects focused on preparing for their school's final examination or final test. This is mainly for students in grades twelve or nine. However, the teacher's curriculum or teaching materials are one step ahead of the national curriculum. This is evidenced by the existence of a teacher's handbook, workbook, and other material developed by shadow education providers, usually designed for one grade or developmental level and are thus seen as helpful for advanced or accelerated learning and remedial learning and this was welcomed by many students (Aurini & Davies, 2004; Kim, 2016).

Furthermore, the curriculum used was similar to the national curriculum, and the learning methods applied in shadow education are more or less the same as those used by school teachers. The teacher-centered learning method is carried out by lecturing and continued with a question-and-answer session or discussion with the teacher. The interviews conducted with the English teachers at shadow education revealed that most of the teaching technique used was lecturing. However, sometimes, the teacher conducts a project for students. These projects are related to taking the test. It is supported by the previous study by Kim & Jung (2019) defined shadow education curriculum as a supplementary curriculum outside schooling provided by educational enterprises with the primary goal of improving students' academic achievement in formal education. Shadow education provision focuses on three main components: individual achievement, personalized learning environments, and customized instructional strategies to fit students' learning needs or styles.

In addition, the assessment conducted in shadow education was the assessment that is based on the output or results of student learning. Shadow education often conducts tryouts that are used as a summative assessments. However, some ELT teachers conducted quizzes or practice tests to measure students' understanding of the current topic or subject of the material. The tryout is conducted once every six months for secondary-level students in grade twelve. However, the practice test is conducted monthly for the rest of the students, besides measuring students' understanding of English. The tryout was also conducted as preparation for the national and School final examinations for grades twelve, nine, and six. Each student's tryout result would be announced soon after the tryout. These results will be distributed to parents so that they can know and monitor their child's development.

## Students' Perspectives on ELT in Shadow Education

### *Perspectives on teaching materials, teaching, and learning activities*

The interview results found that students enjoyed how the teacher taught English in class because the teacher presented the material in a fun and exciting way that was easy to understand. The material taught will also follow according to the national curriculum at School. One meeting usually takes sixty to ninety minutes and is conducted once a week. Teaching and learning activities usually begin with the teacher explaining the material in front of the class, then working on the assignments together, then discussing and giving feedback.

*"The English learning activity in the class went very well because the teacher explained very well and relaxed." [S02, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, Interview]*

*"The material is easy to understand, the language used is also easy to digest" [S03, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, interview]*

From those statements above, teachers could engage students well in teaching and learning activities. She or he created a comfortable classroom for students to learn and understand the material since the teacher, as one of the sources in the learning activity, must facilitate a fun learning environment for the student in the classroom. One of the teachers' duties is to make an election and decide the appropriate methods for teaching learning activities. Gadjamowidcz (2012) stated that there could be different typologies of methods used: (1) methods based on words, such as lecture, story, talk, description, discussion, and work with the book; (2) methods based on observation and assessment, such as display and measurement; (3) methods based on the practical activity of students, such as laboratory and practical class; (4) activating methods, such as theater and staging, teaching games, etc. These methods enable students to master knowledge along with the ability to use it in practice. Due to the students' perspectives, the learning activity in PT-E is more flexible and relaxing. Students were easier to understand the material teachers gave because it was delivered communicably and in detail. Teachers implemented word-based methods during the teaching and learning activity in shadow education. This atmosphere enhances students to feel comfortable and enjoy learning. This evidence was supported by Scarfo and Littleford (2008), that stated that by setting up an enjoyable environment, students are allowed to manipulate, explore, and experience a variety of new material, which enhances learning. Furthermore, there are several needs of students that can be used as a fundamental or new innovation by teachers in creating a learning activity and best method of learning that is by the needs of students so that the objectives of learning can be achieved optimally. Based on the results of interviews, students preferred the learning method using audio-visual media that can improve their reading and speaking skills.

*"It is more fun using audio-visuals audio-visuals" [S01, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, interview]*

*"For the English materials taught, it should be more in improving speaking and reading skills to students." [S03, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, Interview]*

Generally, a teacher should use the media in their best teaching. It can facilitate learning or increase the understanding of materials. Both teachers and students are helped by using media to achieve learning goals. Mainly this study result showed that students expected their teacher to maximize the use of learning media. So that students would be more engaged in the learning activity. Audio-visual media can be created optimally, physically, and mentally through a learning environment (De Porter & Hernacki, 2000). This becomes an important thing that can encourage the students to improve their skills during the teaching and learning activity.

### ***Perspectives on Teaching and Learning Outcome***

Regarding English learning outcomes, almost all students said that they were satisfied with their English scores at School and that it was improved more than before. The satisfaction was obtained because the learning in PT-E helped them increase their understanding of the material and, at the same time, also increased their ability to speak English because the teacher gave a straightforward and detailed explanation.

*“The grades I get at school are much higher and better, of course.” [S03, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, Interview]*

*“My grades have become more stable.” [S04, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, Interview]*

Even though they come from different schools, almost all students said there was an increase in the grades obtained in learning English. It proves that shadow education is effective in enhancing students' achievement; it can be seen in many countries, including South Korea (Lee, 2007; Park, 2008), Japan (Mori & Baker, 2010), Bangladesh (Nath, 2008), Sri Lanka (Pallegedara, 2011), and Canada (Davies & Guppy, 2010). The study supported by Carr and Wang (2015, p. 1) found that after-school programs or private tutoring positively impact "improving students' academic outcomes, promoting a more equitable school system without sacrificing the mental wellbeing of students." Mustary's (2019) research also explored shadow education and its impacts caused on students in Bangladesh. The results showed that 70% of the participants agreed that shadow education had helped students perform better in School. Since the current studies prove this, the data concludes that the presence of shadow education positively affects students' achievement and grades.

### ***Perspectives on Teaching and Learning Media***

Next are students' perceptions of the learning media used in tutoring. Based on the interview results, the media used by teachers question practice application platforms and LKS books from institutions and schools. The application platform also does questions and exercises after each material presentation. The PTI proposed this platform, combining online and offline, mostly known as hybrid learning.

*“Usually use the internet and textbooks.” [S04, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, Interview]*

*“Usually the media is used to do some assignments and practice” [S03, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, interview]*

As an additional innovation in learning media to be more varied, students wanted the teacher to use other media, such as songs or other audio-visual media, instead of only using books in the learning process in PT-E. Since every English teacher knows that boredom is the first enemy and to avoid it, the learning environment should be exciting, and the whole learning process should be an enjoyable experience and no doubt. Teachers are considered creative and innovative in utilizing the media, especially audio-visual media. Bavaro (1989), as cited in Mutar (2009), stated that audio-visuals are essential in learning technical EFL because they can stimulate learners and encourage them to learn a foreign language. The study was also supported by Madhuri (2013), who found that audio-visual tools for students can improve speaking skills several times over, more than other methods.

### ***Perspectives on Teacher's Teaching Performance***

Based on the interview results, many students gave positive testimonials about the teacher's attitude toward teaching. This is evidenced by the data, which states that students think

that teachers teach flexibly, politely, straightforwardly, and clear in explaining the teaching materials during the learning activity in the classroom. This makes students feel comfortable in the learning process. However, some students criticize the teacher for telling stories only sometimes because it makes them quickly bored and get lower focus even Though teachers have their characteristics in teaching.

*"The teacher is good, not rigid, flexible, and can build communication with students." [S01, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, Interview]*

*"The teacher teaches in a relaxed and friendly manner." [S02, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, Interview]*

*"I like it because the teaching is relaxed and not stiff or tense." [S03, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, Interview]*

*"I liked it because he could take example problems from his story. However, sometimes I get bored and lose focus on the material when I hear his stories." [S04, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, Interview]*

Students hope that teachers maintain their teaching attitude and add innovations in their teaching and learning activities during the class. The way the teacher uses her language and good performance supports the students' engagement during the teaching and learning process. In order to stay current with the most recent trends, instructional strategies, and pedagogical practices in the field of education, teachers must constantly advance their professional selves. Undoubtedly, staying current and relevant is essential to meeting the educational demands of students and assisting them in realizing their full potential. A teacher's actions or inactions in the classroom significantly impact how well students learn. Therefore, we must emphasize how a teacher's effectiveness affects students' academic success or failure. According to Palupi's (2014) findings, there is a positive relationship between teacher performance in teaching and learning activities, and the higher the teacher's performance, the better the student learning outcomes. The teacher's engagement will influence the learning environment for the student. Then, student learning results will show themselves as behaviors that encourage student acceptance of learning.

#### ***Perspectives on the Language Used by Teacher***

Students enjoyed how teachers communicated and explained learning by using two languages, Indonesian and English, or bilingual. Based on the results of student interviews, teachers use two languages during learning, specifically when explaining material and question and answer sessions and discussions. It is undoubtedly beneficial for students because they feel that the teacher helps them improve their vocabulary mastery when they hear new vocabulary spoken by the teacher.

*"The teacher uses English when explaining the material, and when asking questions with students, if there are students who do not know the meaning, the teacher is happy to provide the translation." [S03, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, Interview]*

*"50-50 anyway, because if you do not understand English, you can convey it in Indonesian." [S02, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, Interview]*

The use of English as a medium of instruction has been taught in many studies, and there are several theoretical reasons why the use of English by teachers to teach English is



essential. In short, students would never learn to know a language being learned if nobody uses it to which they are exposed. As a target language or foreign language being learned, the use of English by the teacher during instruction contributes to students' language acquisition. This is supported by a study from Littlewood (1986), who proposed that in the acquisition process, a child constructs his knowledge of rules of his first language through habit formation processes such as imitating, reinforcing, and repeating the speech of people around his family.

### ***Perspectives on the Learning Challenges***

The problem most students face is the need to master vocabulary in English, so when they work on problems in English, they still need help translating each sentence. On the other hand, students also need more confidence in speaking English during learning.

*"Lack of vocabulary, so I am confused when I do the questions." [S01, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, Interview]*

*"Still lacking confidence when spoken to in English " [S03, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, interview]*

However, in the face of the above challenges, students try to solve their problems while learning English in tutoring, including doing many practice questions and taking notes on the teacher's explanation.

*"Practice a lot and note down new vocabulary." [S03, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, Interview]*

*"Sometimes I read English novels & do quizzes on Zenius app" [S04, December, 7<sup>th</sup> 2022, Interview]*

They did self-assessment and evaluation; generally, student Self-Assessment refers to training students to evaluate their work to improve it (Rolheiser & Ross, 2000). The role of student self-assessment in learning a language, especially English, is significant. Students' beliefs in themselves will significantly impact whether they avoid or pursue additional education in a subject. This makes sense because self-assessment encourages critical, independent thinking to develop actively involved, self-controlled learners, not robots (Stiggins, 1997; Wiggins, 1993).

### **Conclusion**

Shadow education is a service of private supplemental tutoring that coexists alongside traditional schooling and "shadows" the traditional educational system. There are several growths of shadow education institutions in Indonesia. This aligns with students' enthusiasm to learn in shadow education since it has many positive effects on their learning; therefore, this research proves it. They were zooming out on the study's objectives, revealing EFL students' perspectives on shadow education. Theoretically, the result showed that the programs, materials, teaching techniques, and assessment used in shadow education is the same as the national curriculum. Practically, the student's perspective towards shadow education has an average of positive experiences. Particularly in the teaching and learning activity, learning media, students' learning outcome, and teachers' teaching performance.

Methodologically, this research has attempted to undertake the perspective of EFL students on shadow education. As with all studies, issues with limitations. EFL practitioners and education stakeholders should understand the perspective of EFL students on shadow education of English to design more effective teaching methods and establish educational

policies. The findings can be the basis of further studies, such as exploring the perspectives among parents, teachers, and education stakeholders in language learning in shadow education.

## References

- Alotaibi, G. N. (2014). Causes of private tutoring in English: the perspective of Saudi secondary school students and their parents. *Studies in Literature and Language*, 8(3), 79-83.
- Baldauf, R. B., Jr., Kaplan, R., Kamwangamalu, N., & Bryant, P. (Eds.). (2012). *Language Planning in primary schools in Asia*. London; New York: Routledge.
- Bourdieu, P. (1977). The economics of linguistic exchanges. *Social Science Information*, 16(6), 645–668.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*. (Online). <http://eprints.uwe.ac.uk>.
- Bray, M., & Kwok, P. (2003). Demand for private supplementary tutoring: Conceptual Considerations and socioeconomic patterns in Hong Kong. *Economics of Education Review*, 22, 611–620.
- Bray, M., & Kwo, O. (2013). Behind the façade of fee-free education: Shadow education and its implications for social justice. *Oxford Review of Education*, 39(4), 480–497.
- Bray, M., & Lykins, C. (2012). *Shadow education: Private supplementary tutoring and its Implications for policymakers in Asia*. Manila: Asian Development Bank.
- Bray, M., & Silova, I. (2006). The private tutoring phenomenon: International patterns and Perspectives (I. Silova, V. Budiene & M. Bray, Eds.). *Education in a Hidden MarketPlace: Monitoring of Private Tutoring* (pp. 27-40). New York: Open Society Institute.
- Bray, M., Kobakhidze, M. N., Zhang, W., & Liu, J. (2018). The hidden curriculum in a Hidden marketplace: Relationships and values in Cambodia's shadow education system. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 50(8), 435-455. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220272.2018.1461932>
- Dardjowidjojo., S. (1996). English Policies and their Classroom Impact in Some ASEAN/ Asian Countries. Paper presented at the RELC Seminar on Second Language Classrooms of Tomorrow: Issues and Responses, 22-24 April 1996, Singapore.
- Ediger, M. (2002). Psychological Lesson Plans and Units in Reading. *Eric Journal*, 4(41), 1–17.
- Erling, E. J., & Seargeant, P. (Eds.). (2013). *English and development: Policy, pedagogy and Globalization*. Bristol; Buffalo; Toronto: Multilingual Matters.
- Gajdamowicz. H. (2012). *Tradycje nauczania wychowującego w polskiej pedagogice*. *Paedagogia Christiana* 1/29, pp. 123-140.
- Hamid, M. O., Sussex, R., & Khan, A. (2009). Private tutoring in English for secondary school students in Bangladesh. *TESOL Quarterly*, 43(2), 281–308.
- Hamid, M. O. (2010). Globalization, English for Everyone, and English teacher capacity: Language policy discourses and realities in Bangladesh. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 11(4), 289–310.
- Huda., N. (1993). *Reorientation in the Objective of ELT in Secondary Schools in Indonesia*. In N. Bird, I. Harris & M. Ingham (eds.), *Language and Content*. Hong Kong: Institute of Language Education.
- Handler, B. (2010). Teacher as Curriculum Leader: A Consideration of the Appropriateness of that Role Assignment to Classroom-based Practitioners. *International Journal of Teacher Leadership*, 3(3), 33–42.
- Hawanti, S. (2014). Implementing Indonesia's English language teaching policy in primary schools: The role of teachers' knowledge and beliefs. *International Journal of Pedagogies and Learning*, 9(2), 162–170.

- Kim, Y. C., & Jung, J. H. (2019). *Shadow Education as Worldwide Curriculum Studies*. Palgrave Macmillan. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-03982-0>
- Lee, J.-T., Kim, Y.-B., & Yoon, C.-H. (2004). The effects of pre-class tutoring on student Achievement: Challenges and implications for public education in Korea. *KEDI Journal of Educational Policy*, 1(1), 25–42.
- Lee, B. (2010). The pre-university English-educational background of first-year college students in a foreign language program: A tale of diverse private education and English proficiency. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11(3), 69–82.
- Loyalka, P., & Zakharov, A. (2016). Does shadow education help students prepare for college? Evidence from Russia. *International Journal of Educational Development*, pp. 49, 22–30.
- Madhuri, J. N. (2013). Use of Audio Visual Aids in Teaching and Speaking. *Research Journal of English Language and Literature*, 1(3), 108–122.
- Mustary, M. (2019). The shadow education system in Bangladesh: A Blessing or a Curse? *Global Education in Practice Teaching, Researching, and Citizenship (BCES Conference Book Vol. 17)*. Bulgarian Comparative Education Society.
- Mutar, S. S. (2009). The effect of technical audio-visual aids on learning technical English language at technical institutes. *Journal for Academic Studies*, 8(15), 1-12
- Muth'im, A. (2014). Understanding and Responding to the Change of Curriculum in the Context of Indonesian Education. *American Journal of Educational Research*, 2(11), 1094–1099. <https://doi.org/10.12691/education-2-11-15>
- Palupi, R. (2014). Hubungan Antara Motivasi Belajar Dan Perspsi Siswa Terhadap Kinerja Guru Dalam Mengelola Kegiatan Belajar Dengan Hasil Belajar IPA Siswa Kelas VIII Di SMPN N 1 Pacitan [The Relationship Between Learning Motivation and Students' Perceptions Of Teacher Performance In Managing Learning Activities With Science Learning Outcomes of Class VIII Students At SMPN 1 Pacitan]. *Jurnal Teknologi Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran*, 2(2), 141730.
- Park, H., Byun, S. Y., & Kim, K. K. (2011). Parental Involvement and Students' Cognitive Outcomes in Korea: Focusing on private tutoring. *Sociology of Education*, 84(1), 322.
- Park, J. S.-Y. (2009). The local construction of a global language: Ideologies of English in South Korea. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter.
- Rafique, N., Sultan, B., Ahmad, S., & Imran, M. (2018). Teachers' Role in Implementation of English Language Teaching Policies in Public Primary Schools of Rural Areas in Punjab Pakistan. *Language in India*, 18(4), 252–261.
- Retnawati, H., Hadi, S., & Nugraha, A. C. (2016). Vocational High School Teachers' Difficulties in Implementing the Assessment in Curriculum 2013 in Yogyakarta Province of Indonesia. *International Journal of Instruction*, 9(1), 33–48. <https://doi.org/10.12973/iji.2016.914a>
- Rumahlatu, D., Huliselan, E. K., & Takaria, J. (2016). An Analysis of the Readiness and Implementation of the 2013 Curriculum in The West Part of Seram District, Maluku Province, Indonesia. *International Journal of Environmental and Science Education*, 11(12), 5662–5675.
- Rolheiser, C., & Ross, J. A. (2000). Student self-evaluation. What do we know? *Orbit*, 30(4), 33±36.
- Sadtono., E. (1976). Problems and Progress in Teaching English as a Foreign Language in Indonesia. Paper presented at the International Reading Association Sixth World Congress on Reading, 17-19 August 1976, Singapore.
- Stiggins, R. (1997). *Student-centered classroom assessment* (2nd ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- Tantra, D. K. (2013). Teaching English as a foreign language in Indonesia: A literature review. *Lingual: Journal of Language and Culture*, 4(1), 1–7.

- Wei, Y., & Guan, W. (2021). Should Shadow Education Stay as A Shadow or Exist as Co-curricula Alongside Mainstream Education? *Journal of Educational Issues*. ISSN 2377-2263. Vol. 7 (1).
- Widodo, H. P. (2016). Language Policy in Practice: Reframing the English Language Curriculum. *English Language Education Policy in Asia*, 1(11), 127–151. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-22464-0>
- Wiggins, G. (1998). *Educative assessment: Designing assessments to inform and improve student Performance*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- William, S. (2018). Students' perspective on buying private tuition services. *International Journal of Research Studies in Education*, 7(2), 105–119.